

**THE CHALLENGE OF PLURALISM:
ELIZABETH ANDERSON'S WORK
PHI 4930
SPRING 2023**

Professor: Jon Rick
Philosophy Department
jrick@ufl.edu
310 Griffin-Floyd Hall

Professor's Office Hours: Wednesdays 2-4pm

Class Meetings: M, W, F: Period 6 (12:50-1:40) in MAT 0051

Course Canvas Website: <https://elearning.ufl.edu>

COURSE DESCRIPTION:

Democratic societies aim to structure their institutions and to frame their social policies and practices such that individuals from different backgrounds with diverse values are able to live together as equals on mutually agreeable terms. Yet, reflecting on the inequality and polarization that characterizes many of our contemporary democratic states makes salient just how elusive this laudable aim is in practice. Over the past three decades, the philosopher Elizabeth Anderson has devoted her incredibly rich and incisive body of research to examining ways of rendering these goals of democratic justice and equality available - indeed achievable - against a background of value pluralism. In this seminar, we will explore urgent topics that lie at the intersections of contemporary Political, Social, and Economic Philosophy, through the lens of Anderson's wide-ranging and influential work as well as that of her commentators and critics. Issues covered will include the following: the nature of value pluralism, the social impacts of free market ideology, the value of democratic equality, the importance of educational opportunities and fairness, the imperative of social integration, and the authoritarian structure of workplace. Beyond the importance that these topics bear in their own right, investigating them through the works of Anderson will provide us with the excellent opportunity to see how the thought of an engaging and exceptional contemporary philosopher has evolved through the course of her career.

REQUIRED TEXT AND READINGS:

There is only one required text to purchase for this course: *The Imperative of Integration* by Elizabeth Anderson. All other assigned readings will be available through the class Canvas page. Students are expected to have read the day's assigned reading prior to each class and discussion section meeting. A full list of the required readings for this course can be found in the Course Schedule, below.

COURSE LEARNING OBJECTIVES:

- Identify, describe and explain the major arguments and options in core areas of contemporary ethical, philosophical, and social theory.
 - Discern the structure of arguments, to represent them fairly and clearly and to evaluate them for cogency.
 - Formulate original arguments, anticipating objections and responding in a conscientious fashion.
 - Read and discuss complex philosophical texts from contemporary works.
 - Speak and write clearly and persuasively about abstract and conceptually elusive matters.
-

COURSE REQUIREMENTS & ASSIGNMENTS:

1. **Seminar Attendance:** You will be expected to attend all class meetings. But, you are permitted to miss 3 class meetings, without penalty, no-questions asked. For each class meeting missed (after the 3 freebies), without a legitimate excuse, you will lose 5 points – each student starts with 100 out of a possible 100 points. **Seminar Attendance is worth 5% of your final grade.**
2. **Seminar Participation:** Philosophy is best realized through conversation. My aim is to begin class by framing a conversation, to which all of you will, then, contribute. You are expected to come to each class meeting with a question or a comment about the assigned readings. Additionally, you may be asked to complete various discussion-based or written exercises in class, which will count towards your participation grade. **Seminar Participation is worth 20% of your final grade.**
3. **Discussion Board Posts:** By 5pm on Wednesday for most weeks of the course, you will be required to make a short critical discussion post on that week's readings. A detailed set of instructions and rubric explaining the requirements and expectations for these discussion posts will be made available before the second week of class. **Discussion Board Posts are worth 15% of the final grade.**
4. **Essay Assignments:** You will be required to write two essays for this course. Detailed essay instructions and prompts will be distributed two weeks prior to the due date of the essay assignment.
 - (i) **Essay #1:** This essay will be a minimum of 1500 words and a maximum of 1750 words. Due Date: 5:00pm on Sunday, March 5th. This essay will be submitted electronically, via an Assignment link on Canvas. **Worth 25% of the final grade.**
 - (ii) **Essay #2:** This essay will be a minimum of 2000 words and a maximum of 2500 words. Due Date: 5:00pm on Friday, April 28th. This essay will be submitted electronically, via an Assignment link on Canvas. **Worth 25% of the final grade.**

ADDITIONAL COURSE EXPECTATIONS

1. **Essay Source Materials:** Any source materials appealed to in your essay assignments that do not come from assigned course texts, *must* be cleared with the professor at least 1 week prior to the due date of the assignment. If you do not clear additional sources with the professor 1 week prior to turning in your paper, you will be penalized (10% for each source not-cleared, *only if* the source is cited). None of the assignments for this class will require resources beyond the required readings.
2. **Text and Note Taking:** In each class session, we will be taking an in-depth look at the assigned readings for that session. You are expected to have a copy of the text(s) with you, and you will benefit from being able to mark the passages that are focused on in discussion.

SUMMARY OF GRADED REQUIREMENTS

5%	Seminar Attendance
20%	Seminar Participation
15%	Discussion Board Posts
25%	Essay Assignment #1
35%	Essay Assignment #2

Grading Scale			
Letter	4 pt. scale		100 pt. scale
A	4.0	(3.835-4.0)	94-100
A-	3.67	(3.495-3.834)	90-93
B+	3.33	(3.165-3.494)	87-89
B	3.0	(2.835-3.164)	84-86
B-	2.67	(2.495-2.834)	80-83
C+	2.33	(2.165-2.494)	77-79
C	2.0	(1.835-2.164)	74-76
C-	1.67	(1.495-1.834)	70-73
D+	1.33	(1.165-1.494)	67-69
D	1.0	(0.835-1.164)	64-66
D-	0.67	(0.495-0.834)	60-63
E	0.0	(0.0-0.494)	0-59

ESSAY SUBMISSION AND LATE SUBMISSION POLICY

In general, requirements for section attendance and make-up exams, assignments, and other work are consistent with university policies specified at:

<https://catalog.ufl.edu/ugrad/current/regulations/info/attendance.aspx>.

More specifically, the following policies will be adhered to:

1. All in-section assignments will need to be completed during the section meeting in which they are assigned. If you have extenuating circumstances (consistent with the University guidelines detailed in the link above and are able to present a written excuse), accommodations may be made (but there are no guarantees here). You will need to contact the professor within 48 hours of the section meeting that you will miss in order to determine whether accommodations can be made.

2. All essays assignments will be submitted online via an Assignment/Turnitin.com link on the course's Canvass page. Essays must be submitted as either .doc or .docx files. Failure to submit in these formats will result in penalties and will require resubmission in the proper format.
3. Late submission of papers will be penalized 3% for each day that the assignment is late. For instance, if a paper is due on Friday at 5:00pm, it will be counted as 1 day late if submitted between 5:01pm Friday and 5:00pm Saturday (submissions between 5:01pm Saturday and 5:00pm Sunday will count as 2 days late, and so on). Late submissions will be made via Canvas/Turnitin.

CANVAS E-LEARNING ENVIRONMENT

This course is supplemented by online content in the e-Learning environment known as "Canvas." To login to the e-Learning site for this course, go to <https://elearning.ufl.edu/>, click the **e-Learning in Canvas** button, and on the next page enter your Gatorlink username and password. You can then access the course e-Learning environment by selecting PHI 2630 from the **Courses** pull-down menu at the top of the page. **If you encounter any difficulties logging in or accessing any of the course content, contact the UF Computing Help Desk at (352) 392-4537.**

CLASS CONDUCT POLICIES

Students and faculty each have responsibility for maintaining an appropriate learning environment. Those who fail to adhere to such behavioral standards may be subject to discipline. Professional courtesy and sensitivity are especially important with respect to individuals and topics dealing with differences of race, culture, religion, politics, sexual orientation, gender, gender variance, and nationalities. Class rosters are provided to the instructor with the student's legal name. I will gladly honor your request to address you by an alternate name or gender pronoun. Please advise me of this preference early in the semester so that I may make appropriate changes to my records.

Students are expected to attend class and to have done all assigned reading in advance. Failure to do so will adversely affect students' ability to perform well in this course. The use of smart phones during class is not permitted. Requirements for class attendance and make-up exams, assignments, and other work in this course are consistent with university policies that can be found at: <https://catalog.ufl.edu/ugrad/current/regulations/info/attendance.aspx>.

COVID-19 RECOMMENDATIONS

In response to COVID-19, the following recommendations are in place to maintain your learning environment, to enhance the safety of our in-classroom interactions, and to further the health and safety of ourselves, our neighbors, and our loved ones.

- If you are not vaccinated, get vaccinated. Vaccines are readily available and have been demonstrated to be safe and effective against the COVID-19 virus. Visit one.ufl.edu for screening/testing and vaccination opportunities.
 - If you are sick, stay home. Please call your primary care provider if you are ill and need immediate care or the UF Student Health Care Center at 352-392-1161 to be evaluated.
 - Course materials will be provided to you with an excused absence, and you will be given a reasonable amount of time to make up work.
-

ACCOMMODATION FOR STUDENTS WITH DISABILITIES:

Students with disabilities requesting accommodations should first register with the Disability Resource Center (352-392-8565, www.dso.ufl.edu/drc/) by providing appropriate documentation. Once registered, students will receive an accommodation letter which must be presented to the instructor when requesting accommodation. Students with disabilities should follow this procedure as early as possible in the semester.

CLASS RECORDING POLICY

Students are allowed to record video or audio of class lectures. However, the purposes for which these recordings may be used are strictly controlled. The only allowable purposes are (1) for personal educational use, (2) in connection with a complaint to the university, or (3) as evidence in, or in preparation for, a criminal or civil proceeding. All other purposes are prohibited. Specifically, students may not publish recorded lectures without the written consent of the instructor.

A “class lecture” is an educational presentation intended to inform or teach enrolled students about a particular subject, including any instructor-led discussions that form part of the presentation, and delivered by any instructor hired or appointed by the University, or by a guest instructor, as part of a University of Florida course. A class lecture does not include lab sessions, student presentations, clinical presentations such as patient history, academic exercises involving solely student participation, assessments (quizzes, tests, exams), field trips, private conversations between students in the class or between a student and the faculty or lecturer during a class session.

Publication without permission of the instructor is prohibited. To “publish” means to share, transmit, circulate, distribute, or provide access to a recording, regardless of format or medium, to another person (or persons), including but not limited to another student within the same class section. Additionally, a recording, or transcript of a recording, is considered published if it is posted on or uploaded to, in whole or in part, any media platform, including but not limited to social media, book, magazine, newspaper, leaflet, or third party note/tutoring services. A student who publishes a recording without written consent may be subject to a civil cause of action instituted by a person injured by the publication and/or discipline under UF Regulation 4.040 Student Honor Code and Student Conduct Code.

HONOR CODE & PLAGIARISM POLICY

Most instances of academic dishonesty can be avoided by thoroughly citing the resources you have used to help you understand the topic on which you're writing. **If you have read something that helped you understand the material, cite it!** Failure to cite sources is the most common (and easily avoidable) academic offence. Detailed citation instructions will be provided with your essay assignments.

UF students are bound by The Honor Pledge, which states:

“We, the members of the University of Florida community, pledge to hold ourselves and our peers to the highest standards of honor and integrity by abiding by the Honor Code. On all work submitted for credit by students at the University of Florida, the following pledge is either required or implied: “On my honor, I have neither given nor received unauthorized aid in doing this assignment.”

The Honor Code (<https://sccr.dso.ufl.edu/policies/student-honor-code-student-conduct-code/>) specifies a number of behaviors that are in violation of this code and the possible sanctions. Furthermore, you are obligated to report any condition that facilitates academic misconduct to appropriate personnel. If you have any questions or concerns, please consult with the instructor.

Plagiarism on any assignment will automatically result in a grade of “E” for the course. Plagiarism is defined in the University of Florida's Student Honor Code as follows:

“A student shall not represent as the student's own work all or any portion of the work of another. Plagiarism includes (but is not limited to): a. Quoting oral or written materials, whether published or unpublished, without proper attribution. b. Submitting a document or assignment which in whole or in part is identical or substantially identical to a document or assignment not authored by the student.”

Students found guilty of academic misconduct will be prosecuted in accordance with the procedures specified in the UF honesty policy.

IMPORTANT CAMPUS & ACADEMIC RESOURCES

Accommodation for Students with Disabilities

Students with disabilities requesting accommodations should first register with the Disability Resource Center (352-392-8565, www.dso.ufl.edu/drc/) by providing appropriate documentation. Once registered, students will receive an accommodation letter which must be presented to the instructor when requesting accommodation. Students with disabilities should follow this procedure as early as possible in the semester.

Health and Wellness U Matter, We Care

If you or a friend is in distress, please contact umatter@ufl.edu or 352 392- 1575 so that a team member can reach out to the student.

Sexual Assault Recovery Services (SARS) Student Health Care Center, 392-1161.

Counseling and Wellness Center: <http://www.counseling.ufl.edu/cwc/Default.aspx>, 392-1575

University Police Department: 392-1111 or 9-1-1 for emergencies

E-learning Technical Support, 352-392-4357 (select option 2) or e-mail to Learningsupport@ufl.edu. <https://lss.at.ufl.edu/help.shtml>

Library Support <http://cms.uflib.ufl.edu/ask>

Writing Studio 2215 Turlington Hall, 846-1138. <http://writing.ufl.edu/writing-studio/>

EMAIL POLICY

(1) If you need some practical information about the course you should **look at most recently updated syllabus or on the website.**

(2) If you want to discuss a substantive philosophical question you should bring it up in class or come to office hours. I will not be able to respond to in-depth, substantive questions about the readings or assignments over email. However, I am *more* than happy to discuss substantive questions of these sorts in office hours. So, please join my regularly scheduled office hours or schedule a separate appointment. I will be happy to address short, logistical, non-substantive questions over email.

If, after reading (1) & (2) you still think you should email the professor, you are welcome to do so at the 'ufl' addresses listed at the top of this syllabus. Please use your 'ufl' address.

Emails received after 5pm may not be responded to until after 9am the following day.

COURSE EVALUATION PROCESS

Students are expected to provide professional and respectful feedback on the quality of instruction in this course by completing course evaluations online via GatorEvals. Guidance on how to give feedback in a professional and respectful manner is available at <https://gatorevals.aa.ufl.edu/students/>. Students will be notified when the evaluation period opens, and can complete evaluations through the email they receive from GatorEvals, in their Canvas course menu under GatorEvals, or via <https://ufl.bluer.com/ufl/>. Summaries of course evaluation results are available to students at <https://gatorevals.aa.ufl.edu/public-results/>.

HOW TO DO WELL IN THIS COURSE!

1. **Be sure to read the assigned material before class.** This will help to ensure that our seminar time is quality time.

2. **After seminar, re-read the material for the session:** pay special attention to the questions that you had before. Hopefully the material will make much more sense to you now!

3. **Bring specific questions with you to seminar meetings.** It's totally normal to find aspects of the readings difficult and opaque! Come to seminar with specific questions in mind.

4. **See me in office hours:** Philosophy is tough! It's natural to have lurking (and new) questions even after our seminar discussions. That's what office hours are for! Don't be shy!

5. **Manage your time well.** Many students make the mistake of waiting until a few days before papers are due to start writing. This is not a helpful way to manage your time and efforts. Getting started early on your papers by formulating outlines and drafts will *really, really* help to improve your final product. The **same number of hours** devoted to the material BEFORE class can lead to a much more efficient use of your time, better understanding, and higher grades.

6. **Familiarize yourself with Philosophical Terms & Methods:** Here are links to Jim Pryor's guides to philosophical terms and methods, reading philosophy, and writing a philosophical paper. These are *very* helpful, short additional resources. I *strongly* recommend checking them out:

<http://www.jimpryor.net/teaching/vocab/index.html>

<http://www.jimpryor.net/teaching/guidelines/reading.html>

<http://www.jimpryor.net/teaching/guidelines/writing.html>

LECTURE, DISCUSSION SECTION, & READING SCHEDULE:

- *This Schedule is Tentative & Subject to Revision – please read all class announcements*

WEEK 1: INTRODUCTION & BACKDROP

Monday, Jan. 9 – Course Overview

- *No Assigned Readings*

Wednesday, Jan. 11 – Elizabeth Anderson's Public and Pragmatic Pluralism

1. Nathan Heller, "The Philosopher Redefining Equality"

Friday, Jan. 13 – A Value Monist Backdrop

1. J. S. Mill – *Utilitarianism*. Chp. 4

WEEK 2: VALUE PLURALISM & PRACTICAL REASON

Monday, Jan. 16 – No Class: Martin Luther King Jr. Day

Wednesday, Jan. 18 – Anderson’s Value Pluralism

1. Elizabeth Anderson – “A Pluralist Theory of Value,” from *Value in Ethics and Economics*

Friday, Jan. 20 – Anderson’s Expressive Practical Rationality

1. Elizabeth Anderson – “An Expressive Theory of Rational Action” from *Value in Ethics and Economics*

WEEK 3: THE MORAL LIMITS OF MARKETS

Monday, Jan. 23 – A Framework for Limiting Market Valuations

1. Elizabeth Anderson – “The Ethical Limitations of the Market” from *Value in Ethics and Economics*

Wednesday, Jan. 25 – Challenging Commercial Surrogacy

1. Elizabeth Anderson – “Is Women’s Labor a Commodity,” from *Value in Ethics and Economics*

Friday, Jan. 27 – Discussion Day

- Discussion of the Week’s readings – no new readings

WEEK 4: THE MORAL LIMITS OF MARKETS

Monday, Jan. 30 – Markets Without Limits

1. Jason Brennan & Peter Jaworski – *Markets Without Limits*: Chps. 1-4

Wednesday, Feb. 1 – Commercial Surrogacy & Equality

1. Debra Satz – “Markets in Women’s Reproductive Labor” from *Why Some Things Should Not Be For Sale*

Friday, Feb. 3 – Discussion Day

- Discussion of the Week’s readings – no new readings

WEEK 5: REDEFINING EQUALITY

Monday, Feb. 6 – Luck Egalitarianism

1. Ronald Dworkin – “What is Equality? Part 2: Equality of Resources”

Wednesday, Feb. 8 – Luck Egalitarianism

1. Richard Arneson – “Equality and Equal Opportunity for Welfare”

Friday, Feb. 10 – Discussion Day

- *Discussion of the Week’s readings – no new readings*

WEEK 6: REDEFINING EQUALITY

Monday, Feb. 13 – Democratic Equality

1. Elizabeth Anderson – “What Is the Point of Equality?”

Wednesday, Feb. 15 – Democratic Equality

1. Elizabeth Anderson – “What Is the Point of Equality?” (cont.)

Friday, Feb. 17 – Discussion Day

- *Discussion of the Week’s readings – no new readings*

WEEK 7: REDEFINING EQUALITY

Monday, Feb. 20 – Luck Egalitarians Respond

1. David Sobel, “Comment on Elizabeth Anderson’s ‘What Is the Point of Equality’”
2. Richard Arneson, “Comment on Elizabeth Anderson’s ‘What Is the Point of Equality’”
3. Thomas Christiano, “Comment on Elizabeth Anderson’s ‘What Is the Point of Equality’”

Wednesday, Feb. 22 – Defending Democratic Equality

1. Elizabeth Anderson, “Anderson replies to Arneson, Christiano, and Sobel”

Friday, Feb. 24 – Discussion Day

- *Discussion of the Week’s readings – no new readings*

WEEK 8: EDUCATIONAL EQUALITY

Monday, Feb. 27 – Education & Democratic Equality

1. Elizabeth Anderson, “Fair Opportunity in Education: A Democratic Equality Perspective”

Wednesday, Mar. 1 – Education, Democratic Equality & Adequacy

1. Debra Satz, “Equality, Adequacy, and Education for Citizenship”

Friday, Mar. 3 – Discussion Day

- *Discussion of the Week’s readings – no new readings*

Essay 1 Due by 5:00pm on Sunday 3/5 via Canvas/Turnitin.com

WEEK 9: EDUCATIONAL EQUALITY

Monday, Mar. 6 – Educational Equality & Merit

1. Harry Brighouse & Adam Swift, “Putting Educational Equality In Its Place”

Wednesday, Mar. 8 – Private & Public Education & Opportunity

1. Adam Swift, *How Not To Be a Hypocrite* (excerpts)

Friday, Mar. 10 – Private & Public Education & Opportunity

1. Elizabeth Anderson, “Rethinking Equality of Opportunity: Commentary on Adam Swift’s How Not to be a Hypocrite”

WEEK 10: SPRING BREAK

Monday, Mar. 13 – No Class: Spring Break

Wednesday, Mar. 15 – No Class: Spring Break

Friday, Mar. 17 – No Class: Spring Break

WEEK 11: THE IMPERATIVE OF INTEGRATION

Monday, Mar. 20 – Segregation & Relational Inequality

1. Elizabeth Anderson, *The Imperative of Integration*: Chps. 1-2

Wednesday, Mar. 22 – Causes & Effects of Segregation

1. Elizabeth Anderson, *The Imperative of Integration*: Chps. 3-4

Friday, Mar. 24 – Discussion Day

- *Discussion of the Week's readings*

WEEK 12: THE IMPERATIVE OF INTEGRATION

Monday, Mar. 27 – From Segregation to Integration

1. Elizabeth Anderson, *The Imperative of Integration*: Chps. 5-6

Wednesday, Mar. 29 – Affirmative Action vs. Color Blindness

1. Elizabeth Anderson, *The Imperative of Integration*: Chps. 7-8

Friday, Mar. 31 – The Ordeal and Promise of Integration

1. Elizabeth Anderson, *The Imperative of Integration*: Chp. 9

WEEK 13: THE IMPERATIVE OF INTEGRATION

Monday, Apr. 3 – Anderson's Critics

1. V. Denise James, "The Burdens of Integration"
2. Chike Jeffers, "Anderson on Multiculturalism and Blackness: A Du Boisian Response"
3. Falguni A Sheth, "Commentary on Elizabeth Anderson, *The Imperative of Integration*"

Wednesday, Apr. 5 – Anderson's Critics & Her Replies

1. Ronald Sundstrom, "Commentary on Elizabeth Anderson, *The Imperative of Integration*"
2. Paul C. Taylor, "Who's Integration? What Imperative?"
3. Elizabeth Anderson, "Reply to My Critics"

Friday, Apr. 7 – Discussion Day

- *Discussion of the Week's readings – no new readings*

WEEK 14: CATCHING UP & PAPER PREPPING

Monday, Apr. 10 – Catch Up & Paper Workshops

1. *Reading TBD*

Wednesday, Apr. 12 – Catch Up & Paper Workshops

1. *Reading TBD*

Friday, Apr. 14 – Catch Up & Paper Workshops

1. *Reading TBD*

WEEK 15: PRIVATE GOVERNMENT

Monday, Apr. 17 – Workplace Government

1. Elizabeth Anderson, “Private Government,” from *Private Government*

Wednesday, Apr. 19 –

1. Tyler Cowen, “Work Isn’t So Bad After All,” from *Private Government*
2. Elizabeth Anderson, “Reply to Commentators” from *Private Government* (pp. 131-144)

Friday, Apr. 21 – Peer Review Outline Day

- *No New Readings*

WEEK 16: PEER REVIEW WEEK

Monday, Apr. 24 – Peer Review Draft Day 1

- *No New Readings*

Wednesday, Apr. 26 – Peer Review Draft Day 2

- *No New Readings*

Essay 2 Due by 5:00pm on Friday 4/28 via Canvas/Turnitin.com